

## CAN WE "FORGIVE AND NOT FORGET"?

An address at the Temple Emanu-El-Beth Shalom  
February 18, 1990  
Montreal, Quebec

by  
Professor Frank Chalk

Main points:

### Tutu's visit to Israel: the beginning

Anglican Archbishop Desmond Tutu arrived in Jerusalem on Dec. 22, 1989. The Archbishop of Cape Towns was the guest of Archbishop Camir Kafity, head of the Anglican Church in Jerusalem. Tutu spent most of his visit in East Jerusalem and on the West Bank. In a meeting with Palestinian religious and community leaders on the Temple Mount, he expressed support for Palestinian statehood and said Israel had a right to exist in security. He said a prayer at a memorial near the Al-Aksa mosque to the victims of the Sabra and Shatilla massacre. Then he told his Palestinian hosts: "We support your struggle for justice, for peace, for statehood and independence, and we want to say that you will attain your goal." Then he continued: "We also want to say that we bear no animosity toward the Jewish people, but we call into question the policies of the Israel government. We say Israel has the right to exist, to territorial integrity and to the security due to an independent state, but, equally, Israel must recognize the legitimate aspirations of the native people of this country."

### Tutu's remarks at the Yad Vashem Holocaust Memorial

On Tuesday, December 26, Archbishop Tutu visited the Yad Vashem Holocaust memorial. Asked what he would say to the children of Holocaust victims, Tutu answered: "As our Lord would say, in the end, the positive thing that can come . . . is the spirit of forgiving, not forgetting, but the spirit of saying: God . . . this has happened to us, we pray for those who made it happen; forgive them, and help us to forgive them, and help us so that we in our turn will not make others suffer." Tutu later added: "I pray . . . that Israel will hear the cry of the Palestinians, that they, too, are people created in the image of God." On leaving Yad Vashem, Tutu wrote in the guest book: "This is a shattering experience, and the world must never forget our inhumanity to one another."

Prior to his arrival in Jerusalem, Tutu gave an interview to Ha'aretz in which he said: "I am against violence, but I am also against repression. I condemn all forms of terrorism by any side. But what Israel is doing in the territories is also unacceptable . . . . Jews, who were the victims of a great injustice, cannot allow their government to turn others into victims of injustice. This is such a shocking contradiction."

### Turning the word "forgiveness" into a sword against Israel

the idea of forgiveness: Christian and Jewish notions

love your enemies and pray for them (from Matthew)  
forgiveness is a prerogative of the victim, not a requirement  
God may forgive, but humans are not obligated to  
Is it only Jews who must forgive/ is it only Jews who can  
forgive/ who was injured by the Holocaust -- was it only  
Jews who were injured or the entire human race -- is Tutu  
saying that only Jews can forgive because they were the most  
injured? Not likely.

Christian guilt feelings and the Holocaust: In the end, the  
Nazis were able to . . . use the Christian myth of Jewish  
villainy to their own purposes. Without Christianity, the  
Jews could never have become the central victims of the  
Holocaust. Christianity provided an indispensable  
ingredient, the demonological interpretation of the Jews.

the Holocaust: the connection between memory and justice

Jewish tradition rests on memory. Memory of Jerusalem  
essential for a people in exile. But memory is also  
associated with knowledge. In his autobiographical essay,  
When Memory Comes, Saul Friedlander quotes Gustav Meyrink:  
"When knowledge comes, memory comes too,  
little by little,  
Knowledge and memory are one and the same thing."

Jewish tradition emphasizes that we must learn from the  
past, not simply forgive or forget. The prosecution of war  
criminals; are we asked to forgive those Nazis? But their  
prosecution is essential to deter genocides in the future.  
Does forgiveness mean don't prosecute them. Jews are not  
seeking revenge or playing ethnic politics; they are seeking  
justice as an affirmation of human rights for all peoples.  
Bringing Nazi war criminals to justice does not bring back  
to life one victim of the Holocaust. But the punishment of  
Nazi war criminals is a step in the direction of prosecuting  
bringing all war criminals to justice.



There is a slogan sometimes associated with the Holocaust. The slogan is "Never Again". "Never Again" does not just mean never again must we see a Nazi Holocaust directed against the Jews. It means never again must we see another Holocaust directed against any group.

The Holocaust was a unique historical event. That does not mean it should be isolated and set aside from the rest of human experience. If the tragedy is to mean anything, we must learn from it. We must take steps to prevent its recurrence.

From the point of view of human rights for all peoples, the very last thing that Bishop Tutu should ask Jews is that they forgive the perpetrators of the Holocaust. In a sense the whole post-1945 international human rights movement has its origin in the Holocaust. The first expressions of international human rights after World War II, the human rights provisions of the UN Charter, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the Genocide Convention, the Refugee Convention, all bear a direct linkage to the Holocaust. Having all war crimes, all crimes against humanity punishable is a principle that rests on a legal foundation which remembers the Holocaust and refuses to forgive the perpetrators.

the idea of justice as transcendent

Job, 16:18 O Earth cover not my blood  
And let my cry find no resting place.

Remember the dead and fight like hell for the living.

If I am for myself, who will be for me?  
And if I am for myself only, what am I?  
Hillel